

A PHILOSOPHICAL ANALYSIS OF THE NEW MORALITY
IN THE LIGHT OF TRADITIONAL ETHICS

A Dissertation
Presented to
the Faculty of the Graduate School
University of San Carlos

In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Doctor of Philosophy

by
Eliseo B. Cimafranca
March 1976

162393 c.1
UNIVERSITY OF SAN CARLOS
LIBRARY

9 MAR 1979

PROPERTY OF UEC LIBRARY SYSTEM

APPROVAL SHEET

This dissertation entitled A PHILOSOPHICAL ANALYSIS OF THE NEW MORALITY IN THE LIGHT OF TRADITIONAL ETHICS prepared and submitted by Eliseo B. Cimafranca in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy has been examined and is recommended for acceptance and approval for ORAL EXAMINATION.

Thesis Committee

Paquita U. Beltran
PAQUITA BELTRAN, Ph.D.

Adviser

Juan Lamela, C.M.
JUAN LAMELA, C.M., Ph.D.

Co-Adviser

RUDOLF RAHMANN, SVD, Ph.D.

Member

Jose Ma. Luengo
JOSE MA. LUENGO, Ph.D.

Member

Joseph Goertz
JOSEPH GOERTZ, SVD, Ph.D.

Member

PANEL OF EXAMINERS

Approved by the Committee on Oral Examination with a grade of Passed.

Lourdes Y. Varela
LOURDES Y. VARELA, Ph.D.

Chairman

Paquita U. Beltran
PAQUITA BELTRAN, Ph.D.

Adviser

RUDOLF RAHMANN, SVD, Ph.D.

Member

Juan Lamela, C.M.
JUAN LAMELA, C.M., Ph.D.

Co-Adviser

Joseph Goertz
JOSEPH GOERTZ, SVD, Ph.D.

Member

Jose Ma. Luengo
JOSE MA. LUENGO, Ph.D.

Member

Tecla A. Espiritu
TECLA A. ESPIRITU, Ph.D.

Representative

DEC Region VII, Central Visayas
Cebu City

Accepted and approved in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY.

Comprehensive Examinations Passed: June 4, 5, and 8, 1971.

Lourdes Y. Varela
LOURDES Y. VARELA, Ph.D.

Dean, Graduate School

January 21, 1976

PROPERTY OF UEC LIBRARY SYSTEM

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The writer wishes to express his sincere appreciation and gratitude to the following persons who in one way or another have made the writing of this dissertation possible:

His Eminence, Julio Cardinal Rosales, D.D., for having given the necessary permission to pursue higher studies;

Mons. Frederick Kriekenbeck, former Parish Priest of Minglanilla, Cebu, for providing the necessary assistance to facilitate his studies combined with his parish work;

The late Rev. Joseph Watzlawik, S.V.D., Ph.D., for it was he who inspired him to pursue doctoral studies;

Dr. Paquita U. Beltran, his adviser, for her untiring assistance and helpful advice;

Rev. Juan Lamela, C.M., Ph.D., his co-adviser, for his helpful assistance;

Dr. Lourdes Y. Varela, for her valuable help in bringing this work to a successful end;

Finally, the writer is most grateful to his parents, brothers and sisters for their moral support and personal encouragement in the achievement of this work.

ELISEO B. CIMA FRANCA

Cebu City, Philippines
March 1976

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter	Page
INTRODUCTION	1
1. THE DOCTRINE OF TRADITIONAL ETHICS	12
The Main Tenets of Traditional Ethics	14
Dualism in man	14
Man is as a whole an individual and also as a whole a person	21
Man is a rational being	27
Man possesses knowledge through connaturality	29
The ontological element in Natural Law as its first element	35
The gnoseological element in Natural Law as its second element	39
Human rights and Natural Law	42
Human rights in general	44
Human rights in particular	50
Freedom of choice	57
Freedom of spontaneity	66
The dynamism of freedom	72
The meaning of love	79
Moral philosophy is valid only when it integrates religion into it	87
Man's morality is a revealed ethics	89
Revealed ethics is a "reinforcement which may regenerate Moral Philosophy or endanger it	93

PROPERTY OF UEC LIBRARY SYSTEM

Chapter

Page

The founts of morality are three namely: the object, motive and circumstances . . .	95
The doctrine of intrinsic morality	102
The end does not justify the means	102
Subjectivity in general	103
Subjectivity as subjectivity	106
The structure of subjectivity	114
The Metaphysics of St. Thomas	119
Essence and existence	120
Nature	120
Substance	121
Accident	122
Act and potentiality	123
Summary	125
2. THE DOCTRINE OF SITUATION ETHICS	140
The General Features of Situation Ethics . . .	141
Existential ethics and situation ethics . .	143
The three general forms of situation ethics	146
Situation Ethics Its Protestant and Catholic Defenders	148
The Doctrine of Fletcher and Curran	150
Joseph Fletcher	150
The method of situation ethics	150
Ethics is a method	151
The doctrine of Fletcher's situation ethics	154

Chapter	Page
The natural law	156
The working principles of situation ethics .	159
Pragmatism	159
Relativism	160
Positivism	161
Personalism	162
The heart of situation ethics	163
The concept of conscience	173
Charles E. Curran	174
The ethical teaching of Jesus	174
Wrong interpretations of the ethic of Jesus	175
The eschatological reign of God	178
Man's response to the ethic of Jesus	179
The law vis-a-vis the ethic of Jesus	180
The role of law in traditional Catholic thinking	182
The historical fact of change in Church teaching	191
The adequate explanation for the existence of absolute ethical norms	193
The proper role of law	207
The concept of epikeia	212
The theory of compromise morality	217
Summary	218
Points of convergence	218

* PROPERTY OF UEC LIBRARY SYSTEM

1

PROPERTY OF UEC LIBRARY SYSTEM

	vii
Chapter	Page
Points of divergence	219
The Doctrines of Gustafson and Milhaven	223
James M. Gustafson	223
His fundamental position	225
Perspective and posture in the Christian moral life	228
Disposition of the Christian moral self	231
Moral intentions in the Christian life	234
Christ as norm in the Christian moral life	237
Gustafson's "Situation versus Principles" Article	239
Reasons why one is called a contextualist	240
Distinction in the use of principles is critical	245
John Giles Milhaven	
The meaning of the new morality	249
Sharing God's dominion	254
Creative activism	257
The concept of freedom	261
The new morality and traditional morality	268
The new morality and St. Thomas Aquinas	282
Conclusion	312
Summary	314
Points of convergence	315
Points of divergence	316
Recapitulation	318

Chapter	Page
3. A PHILOSOPHICAL ANALYSIS OF THE NEW MORALITY IN THE LIGHT OF TRADITIONAL ETHICS	324
The Protestant Position	324
Fletcher's Position	324
Gustafson's Position	325
Traditional Ethics Answers the Allegations of Fletcher	325
He condemns categorically the doctrine of Natural Law	325
Fletcher follows the lead of nominalism	332
Fletcher affirms that pragmatism is one of love's working principles	340
Fletcher proclaims the supremacy of the situation in moral decision making	345
Traditional Ethics Answers the Allegations of Gustafson	350
The Catholic Situationist Position	356
Curran's Position	356
Milhaven's Position	357
Traditional Ethics Answers the Allegations of Curran	357
The debate between Traditional Ethics and the New Morality centers on philosophical grounds	357
Curran affirms that Natural Law as taught by St. Thomas and the teaching authority of the Church cannot explain the generic insistence on absolute moral norms	360
Curran affirms that the generic insis- tence on absolute norms is derived from a classicist world view and from an inadequate understanding of the Church	365

Chapter

Page

Curran affirms that the absolute moral norms which call for reevaluation "are those in which the prohibited action is defined in nonmoral terms and sometimes defined merely according to the physical or biological structure of the action"	383
Curran's call for reevaluation of such absolute moral norms does not imply that he rejects other kinds of absolute moral norms	388
Curran's adherence to a more relational methodology in morality indicates his reliance on the supremacy of the situation in moral decision making	389
Conclusion	392
Traditional Ethics Answers the Allegations of Milhaven	392
An epistemology of ethics which gives importance to empirical evidence, not the Natural Law doctrine which gives importance to the purposiveness of nature, is needed in arriving at the knowledge of the absolute moral norms	392
Milhaven affirms that the negative moral absolutes are grounded, not on some absolute qualities of a given act taken by itself, but on an analogy with human law	404
Milhaven affirms that the authority of the situation is supreme in moral decision making	422
Conclusion	423
Recapitulation	424
4. SUMMARY, CONCLUSION, AND RECOMMENDATIONS	432
Conclusion	445
Recommendations	446

Page

BIBLIOGRAPHY 450

APPENDIX 471

 Introduction 471

 The Problem 474

 Purpose 474

 Method and Organization 475

 Importance of the Study 477

 Review of Related Literature 479

 Definition of Terms 490

 Metaphysics and ontology 490

 Being 491

 Morality 493

 Freedom 493

 Situation 494

 Authentic existence 495

PROPERTY OF UEC LIBRARY SYSTEM